

Sino-Tibetan Buddhism across the Ages

Studies on East Asian Religions

Edited by

James A. Benn (*McMaster University*)
Jinhua Chen (*University of British Columbia*)

VOLUME 5

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/sear

Sino-Tibetan Buddhism across the Ages

Edited by

Ester Bianchi
Weirong Shen



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: Gangs dkar (Minyag Gongkar, Ch. Gongga shan 貢嘎山). Slide photo, by Monica Esposito

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Bianchi, Ester, editor. | Shen, Weirong, 1962- editor.

Title: Sino-Tibetan Buddhism across the ages / edited by Ester Bianchi, Weirong Shen.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, 2021. | Series: Studies on East Asian religions, 2452-0098 ; vol. 5 | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021032834 (print) | LCCN 2021032835 (ebook) |

ISBN 9789004467958 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004468375 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Buddhism-Tibet Region-History. | Buddhism-China-History. | China-Relations-Tibet Region. | Tibet Region-Relations-China.

Classification: LCC BQ7576 .S565 2021 (print) | LCC BQ7576 (ebook) |

DDC 294.30951-dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021032834>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021032835>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2452-0098

ISBN 978-90-04-46795-8 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-46837-5 (e-book)

Copyright 2021 by Ester Bianchi and Weirong Shen. Published by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau Verlag and V&R Unipress.

Koninklijke Brill nv reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill nv via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.



Dedicated to the memory of Monica Esposito
(August 7, 1962–March 10, 2011)



Contents

List of Figures and Tables IX

Notes on Contributors XI

Introduction 1

Ester Bianchi and Weirong Shen

PART 1

Early Sino-Tibetan Buddhist Encounters

1 An Invented Tradition: Hva shang Mahāyāna and His Teachings in Tibetan Literature 21

Weirong Shen

2 Attending to the Elders: Icons and Identities of Dharmatāla and Hva shang across Sino-Tibetan Buddhist Milieus 67

Linghui Zhang

3 To the Place Where Tea Comes from: Gyi-ljang's Trip to China 90

Penghao Sun

4 Edicts and the Edible: Digesting Imperial Sovereignty in Lhasa 111

Fan Zhang

PART 2

Tibetan Tantra in the Modern World

5 Tibetan Theosophy: Helena Blavatsky's Tantric Connection 141

Urs App

6 Tantrism, Modernity, History: On Lü Cheng's Philological Method 170

Martino Dibeltulo Concu

PART 3

Modern Forms of Sino-Tibetan Hybridity

- 7 The Combined Practice of Vinaya and Tantra in Nenghai's Path to Liberation 225
Ester Bianchi
- 8 Approaching the Perfection of Wisdom: Nenghai's Interpretation of the *Ornament of Realization* 253
Wei Wu
- 9 Accidental Esoterics: Han Chinese Practicing Tibetan Buddhism 278
Alison Denton Jones
- 10 Tibeto-Mongol and Chinese Buddhism in Present-Day Hohhot, Inner Mongolia: Competition and Interactions 317
Isabelle Charleux
- Index 365

Figures and Tables

Figures

- 5.1 Heinrich August Jäschke, *Romanized Tibetan and English Dictionary*. Kyelang in British Lahoul: Moravian Mission, p. 124. 147
- 9.1 Nuona Memorial Hall Main Building, Nanjing. March 2008. Photo by author. 301
- 9.2 Nuona Memorial Hall side building with Prayer Wheels, Nanjing. March 2008. Photo by author. 302
- 9.3 Dizang Sūtra service attendees circumambulate the Stupa after the service at Nuona Memorial Hall, Nanjing. March 2008. Photo by author. 304
- 10.1 Map of the Old City of Hohhot. © Isabelle Charleux (from Google map) 323
- 10.2 Chinese Buddhist monks attending a main ritual (together with Buddhist *jushis* and Daoist priests) performed by Mongol lamas in the Siregetü juu, summer 1995. © Isabelle Charleux, 1995 325
- 10.3 Rebuilt Tongshun Street. © Marie-Dominique Even, 2006 328
- 10.4 Altan Khan square, with the large statue of Altan Khan and the main entrance of the Yeke juu (see from the south). © Isabelle Charleux, 2012 329
- 10.5 Floorplan of the Yeke juu 335
- 10.6 Jade Buddha, Yufodian, Yeke juu. © Marie-Dominique Even, 2014 336
- 10.7 Abbot's courtyard, Yeke juu. © Isabelle Charleux, 2012 336
- 10.8 Chinese decoration within Mongol Buddhist monasteries: Wheel of life (Bhavacakra), central assembly hall of the Yeke juu (top left); dragons surrounding the Kalacakra symbol, Sitātapatrā hall of the Yeke juu (top right); Caishen, Chinese god of Wealth, great assembly hall of the Emci-yin juu (bottom left); Statue of an elephant holding a *ruyi* 如意 sceptre in front of the Amitāyus hall, Yeke juu. © Isabelle Charleux, 2016 339
- 10.9 Floorplan of the Guanyinsi 342
- 10.10 Avalokiteśvara hall, Guanyinsi. © Isabelle Charleux, 2016 343
- 10.11 Protector deity, Protectors' hall of the Guanyinsi. © Isabelle Charleux, 2016 343
- 10.12 Burqan *Stūpa*, exterior (© Isabelle Charleux, 2016); interior and consecration ritual (website "Baoerhan fota") 346

Tables

3.1	Comparing the two Lam 'bras histories	95
3.2	Comparing lineages in different textual traditions	101
10.1	Comparison between Yeke juu and Guanyinsi in 2016	330
10.2	Ritual calendars of Yeke juu and Guanyinsi in the mid-2000s	337
10.3	Interior filling of the 81.60 metres Burqan Stūpa	347

Notes on Contributors

Urs App

studied psychology, philosophy, and religion at the universities of Freiburg, Kyoto, and Temple (Philadelphia, PA). He earned a Ph.D. in Chinese Buddhism from Temple University in 1989 and is currently senior researcher at the École Française d'Extrême-Orient. From 1989 to 1999, he was professor of Buddhism and associate director of the International Research Institute for Zen Buddhism at Hanazono University, Kyoto. His research focuses on Buddhism (especially Zen), history of orientalism, history of the Western discovery of Asian religions, history of ideas in the East and West. He is a producer of video documentaries on Asian religions, and is author of, among other books, *Master Yunmen* (1994, 2018), *The Birth of Orientalism* (2010), *Richard Wagner and Buddhism* (2011), *The Cult of Emptiness* (2012), and *Schopenhauer's Compass* (2014).

Ester Bianchi

holds a Ph.D. in Indian and East-Asian Civilization from the University of Venice (co-tutorial Ph.D. in Sciences Religieuses received from the Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes). She is currently Associate Professor of Chinese Religions and Philosophy at the University of Perugia. Her research is centered on Sino-Tibetan Buddhism, Chinese Buddhist monasticism, and the revival of monastic discipline and of early meditation techniques in modern and contemporary Chinese Buddhism. She is the author of *The Iron Statue Monastery, Tiexiangsi: A Buddhist Nunnery of Tibetan Tradition in Contemporary China* (Firenze 2001) and of the first Italian translation of the *Gaoseng Faxian zhuan* (*Faxian: un pellegrino cinese nell'India del V secolo*, Perugia, 2013).

Isabelle Charleux

earned a Ph.D. from Sorbonne University in 1998, is director of research at CNRS (National Center for Scientific Research, Paris) and deputy director of the GSRL (Societies, Religions, and Laicities Group). Her research interests focus on Mongol material culture and religion (Mongolia and Inner Mongolia) and the pilgrimages of Mongols in Mongolia and abroad. She is the author of *Nomads on Pilgrimage: Mongols on Wutaishan (China), 1800–1940* (Brill, 2015) and *Temples et monastères de Mongolie-Intérieure* (Comité des Travaux Historiques et Scientifiques & Institut National d'Histoire de l'Art, 2006).

Martino Dibeltulo Concu

is a historian of Buddhism who holds a Ph.D. in Tibetan and Buddhist Studies from the University of Michigan. His area of expertise is the history and historiography of Chinese and Tibetan Buddhist relations. His current projects include a study of the modern incorporation of China into the global flow of European ideas about the Buddha and a monograph on how the study of Buddhist Tantra has influenced Enlightenment legacies and global thought during the modern age. He is the author of “Buddhism, Philosophy, History. On Eugène Burnouf’s Simple Sūtras” (*Journal of Indian Philosophy*, 2017), an investigation of magic, morality, and death in the European search for the historical Buddha.

Alison Denton Jones

is an Associate of the Department of Sociology at Harvard University. She is the author of *Blood Drives, Bodhisattvas, and Blogs: Doing Buddhism in China’s 21st Century Urban Middle Class* (forthcoming), which offers the first book-length study of an overlooked piece of China’s urban religious landscape: the vast number of white collar urbanites who practice Buddhism. She has also published two previous articles exploring the practice of Tibetan Buddhism by Han Chinese in the Reform Era. Her research focuses on cultural and institutional developments in Buddhism in contemporary Chinese societies, with particular focus on urban dynamics.

Weirong Shen

holds a Ph.D. in Central Asian Science of Language and Culture from Bonn University (1998). Currently, he is Professor of Tibetan and Buddhist Philology at Tsinghua University, Beijing. He is the author of *Leben und historische Bedeutung des ersten Dalai Lama dGe ’dun grub pa dpal bzang po (1391–1474)—Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der dGe lugs pa-Schule und der Institution der Dalai Lama* (Styler Verlag, Institut Monumenta Serica, St. Augustin, Germany, 2002) and *Philological Studies of Tibetan History and Buddhism* (Shanghai Press of Chinese Classics, 2010).

Penghao Sun

is a doctoral student in Inner Asia and Altaic Studies at Harvard University. His dissertation analyzes etiquette stories, normative debates, and chancellery translanguing practice in order to explore the role of Mongols in the development of Tibetan historical consciousness from the thirteenth century on. His publications include an edition of the 1780 quadrilingual inscriptions in the Longxing Monastery and a study of four Tantric documents related to Pha Dam pa Sangs rgyas, both in Chinese.

Wei Wu

is an assistant professor in the Department of Religion at Emory University. She received her Ph.D. in Religion from Princeton University in 2017. She is currently preparing a book manuscript based on her dissertation “Indigenization of Tibetan Buddhism in Twentieth-Century China.” Her book project sheds light on cross-cultural and trans-regional religious transmission, specifically showing how the interaction between Tibetan Buddhism and Chinese Buddhism has influenced the religious landscape of modern China.

Fan Zhang

is Assistant Professor of Anthropology in the Department of Sociology at Peking University (China). Her research concerns Tibetan studies, ethnic studies, the study of empire and civilization, and anthropological theory. She has carried out historical and ethnographical studies in Tibet, Sichuan, and Fujian. Her major publications include “Grass-root Officials in the Ideological Battlefield: Reevaluation of the Study of the *amban* in Tibet” (2014), “Reorienting the Sacred and Accommodating the Secular: the History of Buddhism in China (*rgya nag chos 'byung*)” (2016), and “Transcendent Space, Mandala, and Our Holy Empire: Multiple Spatial Imaginations of Mount Wutai and Multiple Identifications in the 18th century” (2019, in Chinese).

Linghui Zhang

holds a PhD in Religious Studies from the University of Virginia and is currently affiliated with the Chinese Academy of History at the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences. His dissertation project is situated in the field of tantric Buddhism and traces the discursive trajectory of the Mahāmudrā tradition from its origination in Indian Buddhist Tantra, through a formative process nourished by Indian and Tibetan post-tantric ethos, and finally to its systematic presentation as epitomized in the twelfth-century Tangut work *Keypoints of Mahāmudrā as the Ultimate*, compiled by a Xixia-based scholarly monk Dehui. Zhang’s work focuses on how the *Keypoints* juxtaposes two soteriological modes of the visionary and the embodied and bridges them in the experiential domain of non-conceptual realization, analyzing it against the multiple philosophical and practical threads from Indian and Tibetan Buddhist Tantra and Mahāyāna scholasticism.